DHHS' and EPA's Proposal to Lower Fluoride Levels in Drinking Water

Shannon Wirz
Department of Community and Environmental Health, Boise State University
INTRODUCTION

On January 7th, 2011 the U.S. DHHS recommended setting the level of fluoride in drinking water to the lowest end of the current optimal range (0.7 to 1.2 ppm). EPA is initiating a review of the maximum amount of fluoride allowed in drinking water based on scientific assessments of health effects from too much fluoride. MCL (Maximum Contaminant Level) is the legal threshold limit on the amount of a substance allowed in public water systems. EPA sets the MCL to address adverse health effects. Current MCL for fluoride is 4 mg/L. The EPA is unsure if they will revise the MCL. U.S. DHHS is strictly concerned with the standard for optimal oral health which is 0.7 to 1.2 ppm.

PURPOSE

• To summarize the scientific reasons driving these new recommendations.
• To outline the effect that the proposed lowering will have on managing Idaho’s Drinking Water Programs.

REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Fluoride in drinking water is one of several available sources.

“exposures to fluoride come from drinking water, foods, beverages, dental products, supplements, industrial emissions, pharmaceuticals and pesticides.” – EPA Report

2. Trends in prevalence and severity of dental fluorosis.

Dental fluorosis – changes in appearance of tooth enamel caused by long-term ingestion of fluoride during the time teeth are forming. The highest risk of fluorosis in permanent teeth is between birth to 8 yrs. (this is when the pre-eruptive maturation of tooth enamel is complete).

Dental fluorosis classifications:

- Normal - Translucent enamel. Tooth surface smooth, glossy, and usually has a pale creamy white color.
- Very Mild - Small, opaque, paper white areas scattered irregularly over less than 25% of the tooth surface.
- Mild - More extensive opaque areas but do not cover more than 50% of surface.
- Moderate - White opaque areas affect more than 50% of the enamel surface.
- Severe - All enamel surfaces are affected and hypoplasia (underdevelopment) is so marked that it may affect the tooth form. Discrete or confluent pitting, widespread brown stains and a corroded-like appearance signify this classification.

CONCLUSION

If approved, no actions needed to bring districts into compliance since fluoridation occurs naturally in Idaho and we are below MCL.

However, if EPA decides to change the MCL and we are in excess, actions will need to be taken.

Fluoride levels can be reduced many ways before reaching the customer, so there is little need for concern.

Ultimately, getting our already low fluoride levels to coincide with the newly recommended 0.7 ppm should not be an issue.

FOCUSING ON IDAHO FLUORIDATION

Fluoride is a naturally-occurring element in the Boise area. United Water does not add supplemental fluoride to its water.

Only three locations in Idaho add fluoride:
- Mountain Home Air Force Base
- Lewiston
- Clearwater County

Boise area system water comes from more than 80 wells and two surface water treatment plants which draw from the Boise River.

Over 30 locations are regularly sampled and the average concentration (after mixing) is 0.4 ppm.

The most recent United Water ‘Annual Water Quality Report’ posted the fluoride range for the Boise area as 0.2 – 1.3 ppm in 2008.

DHHS’ and EPA’s Proposal to Lower Fluoride Levels in Drinking Water

Shannon Wirz, Environmental and Occupational Health
Department of Community and Environmental Health
Faculty Mentor: Dr. Dale Stephenson


Fluorosis Prevalence and Severity:

- 12-15 yr. olds: 23%
- Very mild: 17.2%
- Mild: 4.1%
- Moderate /Severe: 1.3%

Estimates for severe fluorosis for adolescents in both surveys were statistically unreliable since there were too few cases in the samples.

Classifications:

- Normal: Translucent enamel. Tooth surface smooth, glossy, and usually has a pale creamy white color.
- Very Mild: Small, opaque, paper white areas scattered irregularly over less than 25% of the tooth surface.
- Mild: More extensive opaque areas but do not cover more than 50% of surface.
- Moderate / Severe: All enamel surfaces are affected and hypoplasia (underdevelopment) is so marked that it may affect the tooth form. Discrete or confluent pitting, widespread brown stains and a corroded-like appearance signify this classification.

Classification Images:

- Normal
- Very Mild
- Mild
- Moderate
- Severe

Table 2.4. Fluoride Content of Food Consumed Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Group</th>
<th>Sample 1</th>
<th>Sample 2</th>
<th>Sample 3</th>
<th>Sample 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meat products</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk and milk products</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fruit and fruit products</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vegetables</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other food</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.5. Fluoride Concentrations of Selected Vegetables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vegetable</th>
<th>Average Fluoride Content (mg/kg)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broccoli</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrots</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrots</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tomatoes</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potatoes</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Okra</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>